The cover of this catalog is an image taken from the interactive Living Memorials Project National Map. It shows the location and site type of approximately 700 living memorials created, used, or rededicated in honor of September 11, 2001. These sites were documented by USDA Forest Service researchers from 2002-2006, and cataloged in an archive of thousands of images that will soon be made available to the public.

---

Living Memorials Project
http://www.livingmemorialsproject.net/

- ERIKA S. SVENDSEN AND LINDSAY K. CAMPBELL
  USDA Forest Service, Northern Research Station

Land-markings:
12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials
Living Memorials Project
http://www.livingmemorialsproject.net/

EXHIBITION DESCRIPTION
Living memorials are spaces created, used, or repurposed by people as they employ the landscape to memorialize individuals, places, and events. Ranging from single tree plantings, to the creation of new parks, to the rededication of existing forests, hundreds of groups across the country created a vast network of sites that continues to grow.

“Land-markings: 12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials” is a multimedia exhibition that compresses four years of research data and analysis on over 700 living memorials into 12 digitally authored journeys. Social science researchers, urban ecologists, designers, and architects collaborated in order to collect, analyze, and present the dispersed collective response to the tragedy of September 11, 2001. As a whole, this interpretation presents memorials not only as mechanisms by which we mark events and individuals, but also interprets the function and spatial location of these remembrances, treating them as emergent forms that outline how we interact with our public landscapes.

Published by:
USDA FOREST SERVICE
11 CAMPUS BLVD SUITE 200
NEWTOWN SQUARE, PA 19073-3294

For additional copies: USDA Forest Service
Publications Distribution:
209 Paul Dukakis
Baltimore, MD 21225-0243
Phone: (704) 344-0120
Fax: (704) 344-0121

September 2006
http://www.livingmemorialsproject.net/

EXHIBITION DESCRIPTION
Living memorials are spaces created, used, or repurposed by people as they employ the landscape to memorialize individuals, places, and events. Ranging from single tree plantings, to the creation of new parks, to the rededication of existing forests, hundreds of groups across the country created a vast network of sites that continues to grow.

“Land-markings: 12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials” is a multimedia exhibition that compresses four years of research data and analysis on over 700 living memorials into 12 digitally authored journeys. Social science researchers, urban ecologists, designers, and architects collaborated in order to collect, analyze, and present the dispersed collective response to the tragedy of September 11, 2001. As a whole, this interpretation presents memorials not only as mechanisms by which we mark events and individuals, but also interprets the function and spatial location of these remembrances, treating them as emergent forms that outline how we interact with our public landscapes.
# Table of Contents

**Land-markings:**

12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials

ERIKA S. SVENDSEN AND LINDSAY K. CAMPBELL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 01: NYC Found Space</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 02: WTC Viewsheds</td>
<td>08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 03: Hudson River</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 04: Brooklyn-Queens-Long Island</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 05: Staten Island</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 06: New Jersey</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 07: New England Families</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 08: Somerset County, PA</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 09: Washington, D.C. – Arlington, VA</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 10: Forests</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 11: Schools</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey 12: New Civic Grounds</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index of Projects</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgment</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DATA COLLECTION  Documenting living memorials that use the landscape as a way to remember September 11, 2001, is a process that will never be complete. No researcher, however diligent, should have the hubris to imagine that she can catalog and archive all of the possible products of human ingenuity, creativity, love, pain, and loss. Although we created a database of nearly 700 sites nationwide and we conducted formal interviews with several hundred project stewards, there are thousands of sites that we have never visited or interviewed. And even for those that we have visited—sometimes three, four, and five times—the landscape continues to evolve and shift. Some projects were ideas that were never realized. Some sites are already gone. Some memorials have changed beyond recognition. Others remain exactly as they were constructed. And still more are planned. In the end, it will be the trees planted in these memorials that will help us measure the passage of time.

In cataloging the living memorial sites for this exhibit, we were reminded of a comment made by Peg Ogonowski, whose husband John piloted American Airlines Flight 11 out of Logan Airport in Boston, MA. When asked if she considered the living memorials sacred, Peg replied, “I don’t know if I’d call them sacred, they’re very special. They are a wonderful tribute to John. It’s also the big S word, we’d all just rather have John back and leave all these wonderful things behind.”

This is the research project we wish had never existed. But because it does, we hope that it can serve as a way to document the manner in which the public chose to remember September 11.

COLLABORATION  “Land-markings: 12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials” is a multimedia exhibit for the fifth-year anniversary of September 11. This exhibit, as well as this catalog, is produced collaboratively by the USDA Forest Service Northern Research Station, The Tishman Environment and Design Center, at The New School, and Parsons The New School For Design. Compressing the photos, videos, print material, data spreadsheets, and sounds that have been gathered in 4 years of research, the exhibit and this
publication are structured around 12 journeys. Some of these journeys are almost directly based on transects or paths that were traveled (Hudson River, Staten Island), others are a thematic grouping of sites (forests, schools), others are a collage of projects that we learned about over time that seemed to belong together (WTC viewsheds, New England families). Each journey is depicted in a “sketch map” that visually represents geographic relationships between the sites and some aspects of the landscape. These hand-drawn images recognize our subjectivity as researchers and the way in which our own perception and memory of social and spatial relationships shape the organization of these journeys, referencing the work of Kevin Lynch’s *Image of the City* (1964). These journeys occur at multiple scales, from the metropolitan, to the regional, to the national. They sometimes overlap or seemingly contradict each other.

Early in our documentation we met with landscape architects, architects, urban planners, and new media designers, all of whom contributed greatly to initial interpretations. The creative partnership forged with the design firm Urban-Interface inspired an interpretation of this data through urban design and multimedia. Linking sociology to ecology to media in the interpretation of this project, we collectively began to explore the network of living memorials as designed and emergent systems in cities. Moving beyond data collection brought new knowledge that fueled our interest in the process of creation of new public spaces. These spaces exist in multiple realms; they are physically created by hundreds of dispersed stewards, but they are also constantly recreated conceptually by visitors, observers, and researchers like us. Registering all of the countless tactile and interpretive interactions involved in place-making is beyond the bounds of our endeavor. Nevertheless, current technologies such as personal video devices afford immediate access for capturing and representing a wide range of localized cultural practices ranging from displays of national pride in a civic space to subtle notions of remembrance associated with planting new saplings in an existing forest stand. Video is a media format that can merge data, imagery, mappings, media clippings, drawings, and sound to allow for an editorial voice to move through what is an incredibly rich and textured time-space. We crafted the 12 journeys to make explicit one approach to organizing field observations of various kinds of remembrances. Finally, the exhibition recognizes the value of public processes as a constant act to bring shape, acceptance, and knowledge to new forms of social practice. Thus, we envision the exhibition as a step along a much longer path of understanding the relationship between on-the-ground environmental stewardship, the design fields, and qualitative urban ecological research.

**SOCIAL ECOLOGICAL OBSERVATIONS** Disturbance in any system often provides researchers with an opportunity to better understand the functioning of that system. In the case of natural disaster, such as hurricanes or
floods, nature can be treated as an external force that is often blamed for human failings. In the case of September 11, as an act of terrorism, nature provides society with a self-regulating healing mechanism. People ascribe certain human ideals to nature, such as freedom, beauty, strength, health, longevity, or even redemption. As a result, it is not at all unusual for memorials that integrate nature into remembrance to emerge in the days, weeks, months and even years following a tragedy. We consider the emergence of September 11 memorials part of a socio-ecological process of disturbance and resilience. They represent acts tied to traditional, almost universal, mourning rituals and beliefs. Still, the location of these memorials reminds us that in the case of September 11, we lost the things that center us, most notably the body, the city, and control of what is public and what is private in our lives. As we identified permanent memorials in traffic islands, near train stations, in front yards, along waterfronts and in local parks, we began to explore Emilie Durkheim’s (2001) notion of how the ordinary becomes sacred. The ordinary in this case was the interstitial space between home and work. We considered this to be another form of the public commons.

Within this notion of the commons, we found an ideological response that at first glance may tempt the researcher to separate memorials into those representing war and peace. We documented many yellow ribbons and American flags. We paid particular attention to those which embodied what Nancy Fraser (1992) has deemed, the ‘subaltern-counter publics.’ These spaces were the places of counter narratives. Taking this further, we tried to see if certain types of beliefs, as they were reflected in memorial designs, were situated in particular locales. Instead, we found that ‘peace’ labyrinths and community gardens emerge alongside parks that treat 9-11 like other wars. Not unlike the memorial processes in each of the three crash locations, there is a great deal of variation which exists within a particular place. It is important to note that this variation is not typically apparent through the design of a site. Instead, the variation we found emerges from the site’s location, function, and the stewards themselves.

In sum, what we have to offer is just a beginning—an introduction to some of the broad scale patterns in form and function that we observed as well as the micro-level nuances that make each site unique. These findings are informed by a research approach rooted in the methods of social ecology, including interview, site observation, ethnography, and photo narrative technique, and by our ongoing engagement with new media and the design fields. This work is also, inevitably, informed by our own biases, backgrounds, and beliefs. Wherever possible, we attempted to allow the stories of the projects themselves to come through, leaving our observations as provocations or open questions. Indeed, we hope that this project will invite reflection, response, and debate.
Once a location was discovered—in a tree pit, a window box, a vacant lot, or a crack in the sidewalk—a seed was quickly planted and covered with fresh soil. The intentions of this eclectic group of New York City residents were threefold: to honor the individuality of those lost through the diversity of nature; to help fill the psychological void between recovery at the World Trade Center site and the construction of a memorial; and perhaps most directly, to re-establish a feeling of control which might extend to the larger community through the presence of these defiant sunflowers.

“The official September 11 memorial in NYC will not be in place any time soon. We felt something should be in place—not just at Ground Zero, but everywhere. There is a power and healing that comes with digging in the dirt, planting new life and nurturing its growth. It also grows community. Sunflowers are easy to grow, and brighten up the most forgotten, neglected places. Like New Yorkers, sunflowers are tenacious, surviving and thriving in adverse conditions. Sunflowers improve the ground and air where they grow, attracting birds and butterflies. They make sense as one tall way to remember life and make it a bit better—it’s hard not to look up in their presence.”

—Bianca Bob’s Sunflower Project NYC Web site

Immediately following September 11, friends, shopkeepers, school teachers, transit and rescue workers, chose places of social meaning throughout New York City to erect shrines of flowers, candles, images and other types of ephemera. Many individuals sought to reappropriate this public space for permanent use through planting trees, flowers, or in some cases, painting murals. The materials required for these efforts were

IN THE SPRING OF 2002, VOLUNTEERS GATHERED ON DESIGNATED STREET CORNERS IN LOWER MANHATTAN TO LOOK FOR PLACES TO PLANT SUNFLOWERS.

The sites in this journey radiated out from the crash site at the World Trade Center and are dispersed throughout the five boroughs of New York City.
either accessible or available to independent citizens or informal groups. Using symbols of nature, many people sought to interact with the city through stewardship of the land.

This journey in search of found space represents a deliberate act of an individual or group to appropriate a physical place and ascribe to it a new social meaning. This act is the physical embodiment of a basic human need to exhibit some measure of control over one’s environment, to create, to teach, and to leave a legacy. In this way, found spaces are not unlike roadside cross memorials. As Everett notes in her detailed account of Texas roadside memorials, these are extraordinary spaces that occupy a place in the public landscape and in our imagination between the home and cemetery. They become places to meet, communicate, remember, and reflect. But perhaps most importantly, both found space and roadside memorials are considered sacred by those who experience them (Everett 2002). Whether they are temporary or permanent, formal or informal, these memorials separate us from the every day. Similar to roadside memorials, the sustained existence of found space eventually requires legitimization by government and the community surrounding found space.

Found spaces appeared beyond New York City, radiating throughout the country. For a brief time these spaces also emerged in other countries: United Kingdom, France, and Australia. But what happens when the context in which these memorials were created changes from disaster to recovery to remembrance—and inevitably to resolution? Are these spaces still memorials? Do they continue to exist at all?

“We felt something should be in place—not just at Ground Zero, but everywhere. There is a power and healing that comes with digging in the dirt, planting new life and nurturing its growth. It also grows community.”

– Sunflower Project NYC Web site
Our preliminary findings suggest that many found spaces continue to exist online in a virtual community or in communities on the ground. Yet, the social meaning of these found spaces has already begun to change as the events associated with September 11 evolve and other local and global catastrophes emerge. For example, the Living Memorial Trail in the South Bronx consists of new trees planted from river to park to the streets in Hunts Point and is incorporated into a larger community health initiative. By the time of its official dedication in 2005, the Rockaways’ Waterfront Tribute Park was dedicated not only to those lost on September 11, but etched along the brick pathways, also includes remembrances for Rockaway residents who died from other causes on other days. Do these changes in social meaning alter the original intention of memorializing September 11? Or does this suggest that found spaces are more than ephemeral shrines or momentary ‘shouts in the street?’

Perhaps instead, these sites offer a unique and unexpected opportunity to reflect on ourselves, our communities, and what we hold most dear—note that we need ways to remember and memorialize that go beyond the passive experience and officially designated sites.

This journey in search of found space represents an opportunistic act of an individual or group to appropriate a physical place and ascribe to it a new social meaning.

JOURNEY 01 SITES

- East Village Murals
  Manhattan, NY
- Living Memorial Trail
  Bronx, NY
- Living Memorial Grove of Survivor Trees at Brooklyn Bridge
  Manhattan, NY
- Lower Manhattan Engine 10 Firehouse
  Manhattan, NY
- Lower Manhattan Streetscape
  Manhattan, NY
- Michael E. Brennan Memorial Tree
  Long Island City, NY
- Park Slope Street Tree
  Brooklyn, NY
- Sunflower Project NYC
  Manhattan, NY
- Sunset Park Mural
  Brooklyn, NY
- Suntowers
  Manhattan, NY
- The Daffodil Project
  New York, NY
- Union Square Park
  Manhattan, NY
- Brooklyn Bridge Park Coalition Memorial Garden
  Brooklyn, NY
- Trees New York Living Memorial
  Manhattan, NY
- Twin Tower Memorial Garden
  Far Rockaway, NY
From Mt. Mitchell in New Jersey to Sherwood Island State Park in Connecticut to the Rockaways in Queens, these are all places where people stood and could see the Twin Towers, the massive New York City icons. These sites have always been places for gazing at the city’s skyline, but the events of September 11 renewed—and in some cases formalized—the meaning and function of these sites. All of these sites, now memorials, are land that bore witness to the day and are associated with the physical memory of the event. We are compelled to mark the land below, because we cannot mark the sky where these tragic events took place.

People across the United States found ways to connect with the event through the concept of the viewshed—which we define as all of the areas that share a common view of a notable site. The WTC was not actually within view of Haverstraw, a town along the Hudson River in New York State, but the stewards of the project retraced the path of the planes and consider their waterfront park a sacred viewshed. Even farther away, people evacuated and secured their buildings of significance, from Chicago’s Sears Tower to St. Louis’ Gateway Arch. In the immediate days after September 11, these measures were done out of precaution, but some cities later created memorials or held events at these sites of significance. People developed a renewed sense of importance of their local viewsheds of monuments, buildings, landscapes, and skylines, in solidarity with what happened in New York City.
People across the United States found ways to connect with the event through the concept of the viewshed—which we define as all of the areas that share a common view of a notable site.

Some of the memorials symbolically attempt to restore the skyline, or at least remind us of what once was. At the Richard W. DeKorte Meadowlands Park in Lyndhurst, NJ, two footprints position viewers in front of a sculpture of the skyline that lines up with the actual skyline—and included the Twin Towers. Beside that sculpture are two small piers that extend out into the marshy water, each pier made of 110 slats—the number of floors in the Twin Towers. At an old Brooklyn waterfront pier—future site of the Brooklyn Bridge Park—gardeners and other volunteers planted hundreds of daffodils in two, long rectangular beds. Each spring, visitors to the Brooklyn Heights Promenade can gaze at the skyline directly across the river, with two bright yellow flower beds lying below, a silent reminder of the towers, the day, and the people who were lost.

On September 11, many people stood at viewsheds as witnesses, wanting to do something, but powerless to stop the events that unfolded before their eyes. Liberty State Park in Jersey City, NJ, directly across the Hudson River from the WTC, was a triage site, but tragically, there were not as many treatable wounded victims as had been anticipated. Though there were thousands of heroic efforts by first responders and other volunteers, neither the WTC site nor the city could physically accommodate all those who wanted to help. As a result, people began to create living memorials by planting trees on their own grounds to connect and respond to the event. Liberty State Park now has a Grove of Remembrance of 691 trees, honoring all of the New Jersey victims who were lost.

“We are also creating a window to the future, creating an area that is viable not only from a cultural perspective, but from an ecological perspective. A window where we can come and explore what an urban forest actually looks like. That’s why we feel that Liberty State Park is the perfect place for this project and has great potential towards living in the future as well as remembering and honoring the past.”
—Frank Gallagher, New Jersey Division of Parks and Forests
On that day it was apparent that we live in a media-rich, networked environment, with compression of space and time, where everyone experienced the details of the tragedy almost simultaneously, through radio, television, and the internet. Does this compression make those places that are physically—or at least visually—connected to the site that much more sacred? Or has that sense of connectedness become more universal regardless of place? Does this make viewed images of the tragedy sacred as well?

On September 11, many people stood at viewsheds as witnesses, wanting to do something, but powerless to stop the events that unfolded before their eyes.

“This is a unique site in America. This is a site within the vision of the Statue of Liberty, and in the spot where many of our parents and grandparents and great-grandparents came to this country. This is also a site in America that was right across from the World Trade Center. Many families spent considerable thousands of hours here looking for loved ones, praying, and reflecting. It’s also a site that’s natural, that reclaims the earth, and hopefully provides an opportunity for healing: spiritual healing and natural healing.”

—Former New Jersey Governor, James McGreevey, at the 2003 Liberty State Park Arbor Day Planting

JOURNEY 02 SITES
Connecticut’s 9-11 Living Memorial, Westport, CT
Grove of Healing at Sunset Park, Brooklyn, NY
Healing Trees Project, Yonkers, NY
Memorial Treeway of Champion Trees in Calvary Cemetery, Queens, NY
Rockaway Partnership Waterfront Tribute Park, Rockaways, NY
Long Island Nursery LMDC Tree Tagging for WTC Memorial, Manhattan, NY
Brooklyn Bridge Park Coalition Memorial Garden, Brooklyn, NY
Grove of Healing in Seaside Nature Park, Staten Island, NY
Hoboken September 11 Memorial Tree Grove, Hoboken, NJ
Monmouth County 9-11 Memorial, Atlantic Highlands, NJ
New Jersey Living Memorial, A Grove of Remembrance, Jersey City, NJ
Waterfront Statues and Plaques, Jersey City, NJ
WTC United Family Group Memorial, West Orange, NJ
Stewards in this journey engage in the act of landmarking, or the ritual of marking land in order to claim a particular history. As the journey moves from urban neighborhoods to suburbs and towns, stewardship communities are defined by their resource base beliefs, and their topographies. Collective values shape memorials’ form and intent. Reading the forms, symbols, and iconography of the memorial spaces, as well as their special events and everyday uses, reveals that all share this majestic landscape yet its sociopolitical history is interpreted and integrated differently into belief systems pertaining to the land.

Urban ecology groups, such as the New York Restoration Project, the Green Guerillas, Greening for Breathing, and Groundwork Yonkers, saw September 11 as a singular, tragic event, but also placed it in the context of different stressors and tragedies facing inner city residents every day. These stressors include lack of open space, lack of jobs, lack of activities for youth, and poor air quality, to name just a few. A language of healing, public health, and peace pervaded the memorial designs and their accompanying programs of participatory design, planting, and maintenance. Trees were planted in memory of September 11 with hopes for a brighter future in general, which often led to a focus on youth engagement and programming. At Brook Park
and several other community gardens in the Mott Haven area of the South Bronx, labyrinths were created to promote peace, unity, and healing through their construction, physical presence, and use as a path for walking and contemplation. Often a blending of events was observed, where individuals brought the challenges of having lost loved ones to their involvement with new memorial projects. At the same time, individuals brought different histories and legacies to these projects, as many residents in the Bronx and Yonkers are recent immigrants to the United States.

“I think [this project is] different from any other thing we work on. When we planned tree day, we had a lot of people involved who aren’t normally and it was great and I think people felt really good about it. But this is—I think—going to be at a much deeper level. You’re coming together to create something permanent, a memorial, that has to do with healing and pain. Everyone has someone that they can think of, they can relate to that. But not everyone does that experience in a group; in fact, I’d imagine that most people don’t. You do it with your family in some ways. So when you do this with former strangers in a NYC neighborhood—that has to take it to a much higher and deeper level.”
—Elena Conte, Greening for Breathing

“One of the great things about working with Green Guerillas is that it’s bringing people together on a very local level. I worked with groups in the past that were national advocacy, Clean Air Act kind of stuff. And for me, in a way, that’s so impersonal that I get less motivated and impassionate about it. But community gardens, I think, are solving very local problems in the immediate neighborhood by the people that are affected. It’s not just open space and the environment, it’s other things as well, like taking care of kids, eating well, all these other things that I think gardens address in our communities. And I think the living memorials project is also that. In a time when everyone is feeling less safe and less secure and less certain, just the idea that you can create community around trees and the environment and acknowledge those feelings with your neighbors—when normally you don’t really know your neighbors—this sort of provides the opportunity to deal with that. So I think they’re kind of one and the same.”
—Rebecca Ferguson, Former staff member at Green Guerillas

Across Westchester and Putnam Counties, many stewardship groups interpreted September 11 as an act of war and worked to create memorials that placed September 11 alongside the Revolutionary War and World War II in the annals of history. Memorials frequently employed symbols such as the flag, the eagle, the star. Often symbolic trees were planted such as two evergreens to represent the Twin Towers, or an oak to represent strength. Most of these memorials were located on civic grounds. The Lower Hudson-Long Island Resource Conservation and Development Council created an “American Patriot Garden” program, which gave resources and support to...
create patriotic gardens throughout the region. Generally, memorial sites were selected that referenced the town or the counties’ involvement with prior wars, such as the Scarsdale American Legion Memorial site along historic Mamaroneck Road, where George Washington’s soldiers marched during the Revolutionary War. The Hudson River, along with Bear Mountain and West Point Academy, were other sites and landscapes of social significance that serve as reference points to these memorials. Public officials, senior citizens, and veterans groups were frequently involved in planning and stewardship at these Westchester sites. In contrast to the explicit focus on youth programming in the urban sites, these suburban sites sought to connect with future generations more indirectly, through the shaping of history and leaving physical legacy through their memorials.

“Each plaque shows Scarsdale community’s participation in that war. … Our thought on this process was that future generations of Scarsdale and Westchester can come, go through, and understand what came before. What sacrifices were made, why they were made, and what was the purpose… The flags represent the idea that we have a patriotic site. Flags are symbolic of patriotism and the upwelling of patriotism after 9-11 made us feel that it would be appropriate to have the flags here. There are 50 flags for the 50 states.”

—Nelson Heyer, Scarsdale American Legion

“In a time when everyone is feeling less safe and less secure and less certain, just the idea that you can create community around trees and the environment and acknowledge those feelings with your neighbors this sort of provides the opportunity to deal with that.”

—Rebecca Ferguson, Green Guerillas
The social and eco-cultural diversity on the island is staggering and renders the search for order or pattern in memorial form and function a challenging one.

This journey begins in a Queens neighborhood which has always been a crossroads between New York City and Long Island. Chartered as Long Island City in 1870 along the banks of the East River, this area was once known for its fertile soils. In the early 20th century, Long Island City (LIC) served as a critical transportation link which fueled the region’s industrial growth. Today residents and urban planners try to mediate different and competing legacies of the past, not unlike the memorial stewards.

LIC is host to a single street tree planted just outside the fence at the LIC Roots Community Garden, in memory of New York City firefighter Michael E. Brennan. The tree, dwarfed by the surrounding industrial and transportation infrastructure, is a tiny fragment of nature, transplanted and cultivated by humans. On the day that it was dedicated, hundreds of neighbors and students from the adjacent Robert Wagner School, where Michael’s mother Eileen Walsh worked, flooded the street to listen to speeches and tie yellow ribbons on the tree, showing that in people’s hearts and minds, it was not just a single tree. It was a signifier of the forest, a signifier of Brennan himself, and a symbol of hope for the future. This tree, provided by the New York City Parks Department and planted in the spring of 2002,
was the first of what would eventually grow to a formal memorial grove program across all five boroughs—including MacNeil Park in Queens and Sunset Park in Brooklyn. It was an inspiration, a spark.

“When we started this garden 4 years ago, we had one idea to provide a little bit of green space in this concrete and former industrial neighborhood where we are. What you see is the result of the 4 years of hard work, of volunteer effort....A commons or a town square is important to the fabric of every community. The expressions of our public losses and our public triumphs must be marked in public places. And here on Thompson Avenue in Long Island City, we don’t have one here yet.”
—Noah Kauffman, a founder of L.I.C. Roots Garden

Moving from the edge of Queens into the heart of Brooklyn, community gardeners in three different neighborhoods see their sites as spaces of healing, not just after September 11, but every day. The 64th Street Community Garden in Sunset Park features a September 11 memorial walkway outside the garden fence, along the public sidewalk, in the shadows of the Gowanus Expressway. Risking litter, vandalism, and the inhospitable shade of the overpass, gardeners sought to use the memorial to invite the public into the garden. The First Quincy Street Garden in Bedford-Stuyvesant, in partnership with the nearby Vulcan Society, pays special tribute to black firefighters who were lost on September 11. They dedicated a sculpture of a “hook and ladder” that was salvaged from materials on the garden site, showing the infinite capacity of humans to renew and create. On September 11, 2003, the garden held a dedication with a ceremony of remembrance; 42 uniformed firefighters, 20 family members, survivors, and hundreds of neighborhood residents attended.

“Absolutely and categorically it is sacred space because when we had our memorial ceremony, we had a bishop of an international fellowship and a priest of an African Church. They came, we had a libation—sprinkling of the water—and we sounded the names of each of the firemen that we were memorializing, so this is a sacred space. That’s why I said absolutely and categorically, we consider it to be a sacred space.”
—Herb Tibbs, First Quincy Street Community Garden

In Brownsville, the expanding name of the former Jes’ Good Rewards garden is evidence of its shifting meaning and use. Since September 11, it is now the “Jes’ Good Rewards/Benjamin Keefe Clark III Memorial Children’s Learning Center and Wildlife Habitat Garden.” Clark perished on September 11 while working as a chef for Fiduciary Trust on the 96th floor in the World Trade Center South Tower. The garden features a flowering dogwood tree dedicated in memory of Clark.

Each of these urban memorials is a patch of sacred ground. Trees planted in memory of someone; spaces rededicated to events; and the expansion of the
memorial beyond the garden gate, are all seemingly small gestures, but in the crowded, contentious landscape of New York City, they are truly monumental. Residents found ways to draw upon social networks and biophysical resources to create new places of meaning, thereby reinvigorating the physical and emotional “hearts” of their neighborhoods.

Further away from central Brooklyn and Queens, along the southern shore and into Long Island, the memorials change, representative of a breaking point in the physical orientation of neighborhoods and towns. West of the New York City border there is high density, with neighborhoods oriented around boulevards and subway stops, and open space is at a premium. East of that border, density drops off and the primary reference points become the axes of the shores, the highways, and the Long Island Railroad (LIRR). Like beads on a string, towns stretch out along the rail and roadways from New York City. Although reverse commutes are on the rise, most still work in Manhattan—the node of nodes. And Babylon, Ronkonkoma, and Port Jefferson are as much associated with journeys as they are with a single destination, for these towns are also the names of the branches on America’s busiest railway. It is only fitting that—as in New Jersey—many of the memorials we found were at town centers and transit centers, marking the spot with the most direct link back to Manhattan. For example, the train station in Malverne features a September 11 memorial beside trees and plaques to other events and honored individuals.

But on weekends and in summer, the orientation of Long Island shifts to its shoreline. In contrast to the tidy town centers and the congested roadways, people turn to the beach as a release from the order. In that way, the beach is very much like the forest: a place where humans go to connect with systems larger than themselves. We found memorials at the edge of the sea at Breezy Point, Jones Beach, Babylon, and even all the way at the eastern tip of Long Island at Montauk Point. In fact, there are at least two memorials in Montauk: one at the lighthouse features inscribed benches arranged in a circle, and the other, just a block away from the LIRR terminus, hearkens to the found space murals of NYC. It is a painted rock with an American flag and the statement “We will never forget.”

Other natural resources of the island that are integrated into memorials include the Pine Barrens on the North Shore, which are being restored and replanted in memory of September 11. At a smaller scale, natural beauty can be found at sites like the Clark Botanical Garden in Albertson, where the picnic grove was rededicated to September 11. At St. Anthony’s School in South Huntington, an existing outdoor shrine encircled by a grove of trees was rededicated and inscribed with the names of alumni who were lost.

Not only were memorials physically linked to Manhattan or the shore, but they are symbolically and politically linked through their placement and design.
with America’s engagement in war. Halls Pond Park in
West Hempstead is the quintessential Long Island town
to memorials to Vietnam and the two World Wars. At a
larger scale, Eisenhower Park—the main park for
Nassau County—is centered around a monumental
core with flagpoles, and many memorials large and
small, to prior events. Across the pond is the new
September 11 memorial that was dedicated by
President George W. Bush along with Nassau County
officials and family members of September 11.

The difference between the memorials of the city and
those of the suburbs is striking, but so too is the diversity
among sites within the boroughs and among sites in
Nassau and Suffolk Counties. The memorials of this
journey confirm that ideological variation exists within
small, eco-cultural patches. What is interesting about this
is that it can be spatially understood through short term
changes in the use and function of open space.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JOURNEY 04 SITES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>64th Street Community Garden</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breezy Point Memorial</td>
<td>Breezy Point, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cedarhurst Park September 11 Memorial</td>
<td>Cedarhurst, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trees for Life and Unity — Brooklyn</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Islip 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>East Islip, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eisenhowe Park American Patriot Garden</td>
<td>Hempstead, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erhart Clam House Mural</td>
<td>Freeport, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Quincy Street Garden Memorial to NYC Black Firemen</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halls Pond Park September 11 Memorial</td>
<td>West Hempstead, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroes Walk at Twin Lakes Preserve</td>
<td>Bellmore, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jes’ Good Rewards/Benjamin Keefe Clark III Memorial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s Learning Center and Wildlife Habitat Garden</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jones Beach State Park</td>
<td>Hempstead, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Island Nursery LMDC Tree Tagging for WTC</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montauk Lighthouse 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>Montauk, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 11 Family Group — Russian Family Memorial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 11 Memorial Grove in Prospect Park</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September the 11th Community Memorial Garden in Forest Park</td>
<td>Queens, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Town of Babylon September 11 Hometown Memorial</td>
<td>Babylon, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montauk Rock</td>
<td>Montauk, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael E. Brennan Memorial Tree</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-11 Seaford High School Memorial</td>
<td>Seafood, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saint Anthony’s High School Memorial</td>
<td>South Huntington, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 11 Memorial at Malverne Train Station</td>
<td>Malverne, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Island Pine Barrens September 11th Community Forestry Restoration Project</td>
<td>Port Jefferson, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark Botanical Garden Memorial Grove</td>
<td>North Hempstead, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twin Tower Memorial Garden Far Rockaway, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn Botanic Garden Liberty Oaks</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Yet Staten Island households have a long history of balancing two lives: one which is lived on the island and the other, which is experienced through the necessity of work in Manhattan.

Despite being proximate to the World Trade Center (WTC) site, Staten Islanders felt the need to memorialize their own at home after September 11. Memorial shrines were created at the doorsteps of private homes, fire stations, transit stations, and schools. As time passed, what became remarkable was that Staten Islanders, often a group of friends, took it upon themselves to appropriate, organize, and produce public space in the name of those lost on September 11. Nearly all reported they wanted to recreate a public commons—whether a park, a garden, or a woodland—as a place where everyone can go.

Ordinary traffic islands gained new significance as ‘healing gardens’ and ‘spiritual centers.’ The Healing Garden occupies a 65 x 439 feet traffic median owned by the New York Department of Transportation. It is located on main roads in the shadow of the Staten Island Expressway. The median’s location adjacent to FDNY Rescue Station 5, which lost a number of firefighters on September 11, gave it heightened significance after the event. Members of a local garden club planted nearly 100 trees at this site commemorating those who died. In some ways, this memorial is no different than other more notable memorials—even the memorials at the Pentagon, Shanksville, and the WTC. The hope in all cases is that this will be a call for ‘survivors’ to return, reflect, and replant these trees again.

Although it is one of the five boroughs, Staten Island is typically characterized as distinct, even separate, in its identity, politics, and vernacular landscape from the rest of New York City.
What Staten Island memorials reveal is not only the cycle of resilience but that this cycle is not neutral. Social tensions exist within it. Staten Island memorials began as public commons but encountered conflicts over the use and social meaning of public space. One resident of a densely populated, suburban-style neighborhood re-appropriated the traffic island in front of her home, creating a shrine for each Staten Island victim along with a vibrant selection of seasonal plantings. Well known as 'Angels’ Circle,' the site has become so popular that city officials installed new traffic signs to ensure public safety.

Along the shores of Great Kill Harbor, a de-mapped street was reclaimed for a September 11 memorial tree grove by residents of a private condominium complex. The grove was intended as a reflective element integrated into a recently created park along the shoreline. Just a few years ago, this area was an abandoned dumping ground until area residents reclaimed it as a park. They named the site Seaside Nature Park, and legally incorporated their group as Turnaround Friends, Inc. Despite the increasing number of visitors to the park, the site's local memorial status, and the legitimacy of this group as a land steward, several trees were removed when the de-mapped street was sold by the city to a private developer. Resigned to fate, the group painstakingly transplanted some of the trees to a nearby location.

Across the island at the Staten Island Botanical Garden, tempers flared as neighborhood dog-walkers and hikers protested the clearing of a remote wooded area to create a formalized ‘garden of healing.’ The living memorials of Staten Island remind us of the human need to create, to control, and to connect to others, particularly in the aftermath of a disturbance and despite the challenges of limited space and access to that space. Perhaps because it is embedded within the process of resilience, the notion of the commons is what remains critically important to individuals, as evidenced by Staten Island’s
public designs, programming, and stewardship persistence at the living memorial sites. The conflicts are a subtle reminder that the commons is a high ideal which may become accessible in the days immediately following a tragedy. But without vigilance, the commons passes with time and becomes elusive once again. Further, the Turnaround Friends story suggests that the local commons, created by local civic power and agency, is often difficult to sustain when transferred to a larger scale.

Still, the fact that citizens—rather than the state—made themselves ‘first responders’ to recognize the need for the commons is an important lesson learned from Staten Island. At the same time, how many memorials does Staten Island, or any community, need?

The number of memorials which are feasible and desirable may depend on something as straightforward as the current demographics as well as the cultural history and physical structure of a particular place. The notion that there would be or could be a single memorial to honor the victims of September 11 is rather impossible to imagine. At the same time, should public space deemed sacred by a particular group be considered a form of privatization? Or should this type of emergent stewardship be cultivated as a democratic ideal—a way to gain entry back to the commons?

...the commons is a high ideal which may become accessible in the days immediately following a tragedy. But without vigilance, the commons passes with time and becomes elusive once again.
Fathers, mothers, brothers, and sisters left home and did not return. Cars were left at train stations until grieving friends and family could find the strength to retrieve them. Many families of September 11 have been forced to mourn absent a body. Still, there is an ‘obligation to the corpse’ (Harrison 2003, 143). Without a body or a grave site, points of departure became the sites of New Jersey’s living memorials, marking as sacred the intersection between private and public; the journey between home and work.

On a regional scale, one is challenged to locate the center in this diverse and densely populated state. By the time of the first anniversary, the New Jersey Tree Foundation, working with local citizens and family members, decided that due to its service as a triage station on September 11 and its proximity to lower Manhattan and the Statue of Liberty, Liberty State Park would be the site of their living memorial: a grove of 691 trees and a remembrance walkway maintained by volunteers. The New Jersey Governor’s office eventually followed their lead, but emphasized that the grove would flank the site of New Jersey’s official memorial. The New Jersey state memorial to September 11, “Empty Sky,” is a built memorial design featuring two long stone walls which serve to narrow the focus on the lower Manhattan skyline.

In addition to the official state memorial, there are hundreds of local memorials to honor and ‘center’ loss...
using the diversity of New Jersey’s topography and viewsheds. In addition to civic centers and town parks, living memorials can be found near ponds, meadows, cliffs, and woods, suggesting a subtle tension between the tree and the stone. As scholars of roadside cross memorials suggest, there remains a struggle between conformity and protest (Everett 2002). The notion of war and peace are intertwined in many of New Jersey’s memorials as they serve to mourn the body as well as to refuse to passively accept death.

Moving from the secular to the sacred, these sites combine beliefs with ritual (Durkheim 2001). Both belief and ritual are particular to a place, time, and people. Thus far we have found civic groups which were established or flourished in association with a post-World War II generation have emerged as the chief architects of September 11 memorials in New Jersey. Service organizations representing local clergy associations, boy scouts, garden clubs, firefighters’ associations, policemen benevolent associations, Elks’ Lodges, and the VFW posts have taken the lead in memorial fundraising and construction. Incorporating September 11 as both an act of war and remembrance, school groups created many memorials on behalf of entire districts, individual schools, teachers, or members of the PTA. Memorials were established by citizens persuading their local municipalities or individuals acting within branches of government or through public-private partnerships.

Despite the variation found in site location, the repetition of memorial form in New Jersey is particularly common. We find that memorials appear to mimic each other as they reproduce the circle, the stone, a list of names, a symbolic tree, a bench, a piece of WTC, and often include American flags and trees adorned with yellow ribbons. Still, subtle differences do exist. A stone and flag mark the way onto a path leading visitors to a simple bench and pond amidst a prolific wildflower garden in Franklin Lakes, NJ. A flag, stone circle, bench and markers surround meticulously tended flowers at the living memorial in Wyckoff, NJ. Yet the memorial’s viewshed is across the playing field into the dense woods. Atop Mt. Mitchell, the highest point on the Eastern seaboard, newly planted trees are lost within an immense built memorial. At the end of this built memorial, the sea reclaims it.

In arguing the critical need for dissent, legal scholar Cass Sunstein has suggested that the problem with conformity is that it deprives society of the information that it desperately needs (Sunstein 2003). It is through our public space and the landscape of these memorials that we begin to understand what is included and excluded from this public interpretation of a tragedy firmly and rapidly embedded in our nation’s history. But we must look closely at these memorials as multiple social meanings that can be nested within seemingly uniform symbolic design. We wonder whether we are witnessing an expression of uncertainty through the
repetition of design. This uncertainty may stem from various sources, including the lack of the corpse, the sudden and perhaps ubiquitous loss of a physical center, and the burden of interpreting history in real time.

It is through our public space and the landscape of these memorials that we begin to understand what is included and excluded from this public interpretation of a tragedy firmly and rapidly embedded in our nation’s history.

### JOURNEY 06 SITES

| Bergen County September 11 Memorial in Overpeck Park | New Jersey Living Memorial, A Grove of Remembrance Jersey City, NJ |
| Carteret 9/11/01 Memorial Carteret, NJ | Waterfront Statues and Plaques Jersey City, NJ |
| Coopers Pond September 11 Memorial Bergenfield, NJ | WTC United Family Group Memorial West Orange, NJ |
| G.R.A.C.E Memorial at Veterans Park Glen Rock, NJ | September 11 Memorial at Richard W. DeKorte Meadowlands Park Lyndhurst, NJ |
| Saddle River Park Memorial Tree Fairlawn, NJ | Rutgers Newark Campus Tree Newark, NJ |
| Wyckoff Community Park September 11 Memorial Wyckoff, NJ | September 11 Memorial at Bergen Catholic High School Oradell, NJ |
| Hoboken September 11 Memorial Tree Grove Hoboken, NJ | An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum Manalapan, NJ |
| Monmouth County 9-11 Memorial Atlantic Highlands, NJ | Bergen County Police Chiefs Association September 11, 2001 Memorial in Paramus Mall Paramus, NJ |
| | Bergen County Regional Medical Center Paramus, NJ |
| | EPA Office September 11 Memorial Edison, NJ |
| | Franklin Lakes Municipal Complex Memorial Franklin Lakes, NJ |
| | Marlboro Township Living Memorial Marlboro, NJ |
| | Memorial of Remembrance at the Shrine of St. Joseph Stirling, NJ |
| | Richard Cudina Memorial Glen Gardner, NJ |
| | WTC Memorial Garden Middletown, NJ |
| | Hazlet Township 9-11 Tree and Garden Memorial Hazlet, NJ |
TO MANY PEOPLE ACROSS THE UNITED STATES, SEPTEMBER 11 IS FOREVER ASSOCIATED WITH NEW YORK CITY, THE PENTAGON, AND SHANKSVILLE, PA, AS THESE ARE THE LOCATIONS OF THE THREE CRASH SITES.

The less-visible but as powerful social links to places like Boston (from which American Airlines Flight 11 departed) and Los Angeles (where Flight 11 was bound before it was hijacked) remind us that there are forgotten cities of September 11. The lack of proximity to one of the physical crash sites may be a blessing as well as a curse, diverting social services and other needed resources away from the city, but also giving its residents the space and capacity to approach a memorial on their own terms, with slightly less public scrutiny. By not having a WTC-like site in Boston on which to focus everyone’s anguish and various hopes for an appropriate memorial, the importance of community-based sites is amplified.

September 11 family members were forced to face their most private losses in an extraordinarily public context. Rituals of mourning that usually focus on family and close friends were available for public scrutiny, were often conducted by public officials, and were often political in nature.

“For a lot of us, we didn’t receive any remains, so there’s no resting place. That’s a hard thing to deal with. Losing someone is one thing, but in our culture usually you get to see their body and you get to bury them or cremate them. It is something that we expect. And in our cases, in many of our cases we just did not have that opportunity.”
—Peg Ogonowski, wife of Captain John Ogonowski

This journey contains a number of sites that are all linked through the memorial at the Boston Public Garden, which is a node in a geographic and a social network.
Years after the tragedy, many family members are still waiting for some remains or memento to be recovered from the wreckage and released to them. Thus, they did not have the ability to create a conventional gravesite, a space where they could go to connect with their loved ones. In response, many family members set out to create or lend support to other local memorials that honored their loved ones, from land preservation projects, to single tree plantings at civic grounds, to events and dedications at family members’ schools and workplaces.

Although New England families lack these resources that are so central to memorialization—the sacred space created by the burial of a body, the physical place where the tragedy occurred—they drew upon other resources, such as a shared history and identity as New Englanders. We found evidence of “Yankee patriotism” infused throughout many of the memorials. This sort of patriotism honors individuals who served the country or who died, going all the way back to the tradition of the Minutemen and the Revolutionary War. It celebrates fidelity to the country, but does not necessarily blend events or seek retribution on a very different front, in Iraq. It is expressed through the landscape in sites of significance such as town churches, battlegrounds, and historic homes such as Concord’s Old Manse.

The notion of the commons—be it in the form of town green, town park, garden, or woodland—is another resource upon which the New England families relied. The Massachusetts 9/11 Family Fund chose the Boston Public Garden as the site for its central memorial, which is the more formalized space directly adjacent to the Boston Common. The immaculately preserved space is tended year-round by gardeners and there is a moratorium on all other memorials within the space, making the September 11 memorial that much more significant. Indeed, the Public Garden is considered by many Bostonians to be a sacred, historic site and many family members had stories from their childhood or throughout their lives about visiting the garden or riding the swan boats there. As the sketches of this journey illustrate, the Public Garden is the central node in the network of sites that we visited.

“The Public Garden reminds us of everything that is Bostonian. Here’s what we learned from the families. We learned that they all had a connection to the garden, and it was generational. They had lived abutting it, they’d had apartments in Beacon Hill as newlyweds, they had brought their children their to feed the ducks and see the Make Way for Ducklings sculpture, schoolchildren had taken trips where they had walked across the bridge or seen the swan boats. So every family could say, ‘I came here with so and so, or so and so loved it.’”

—Linda Plazonja, former Executive Director of the Massachusetts 9/11 Family Fund
Boston is a dynamic metropolitan area with new immigrants and a diverse, changing population. September 11 affected a particular segment of Boston most directly, given the cluster of memorials in suburbs and rural areas northwest of the city. Still, questions remain about how broadly and for how long the Public Garden—or any memorial—will resonate as a collective, historic icon. What resources might future populations draw upon to share their stories? What narratives, memories, and sites will they hold sacred?

The notion of the commons—be it in the form of town green, town park, garden, or woodland—is another resource upon which the New England families relied.
Depending upon how far back in time one chooses to go, the Whiskey Rebellion of 1791, the tragic Johnstown Flood of 1889, and the completion of the Pennsylvania Turnpike in the early 20th century are all cited as cataclysmic events which changed the social and economic landscape of this remote community in south central Pennsylvania at the top of the Allegheny Plateau.

The crash of Flight 93 in a former Pennsylvania strip mine site in the Somerset County town of Shanksville triggered a long tradition of civic action and local land stewardship. Volunteer fireman throughout the county rushed to their firehouses and kept vigilant watch overnight in the chance that their services might be needed. Hundreds crowded the steps of the county courthouse asking officials what they could do to help. As the weeks wore on, a volunteer docent program emerged after concerned citizens realized they had a unique responsibility to interpret and play host to the site where this tragedy occurred. Many visitors became lost on the winding country roads, needed a place to rest, and initially misinterpreted where the plane had actually crashed. Unexpectedly, Somerset County became a place where thousands came to unburden themselves.

“They wanted to tell you about their experiences, as well as get the facts. They just really wanted to talk about where they were on September 11, how they felt about it, what they thought the government should be doing, how they felt about the Taliban. And we ran into a number of people who had lost people in New York or Washington and for one reason or another couldn’t go there or didn’t...
want to go there, and so they came to our site, because they could, it was accessible, or closer, or they didn't drive in urban areas but they could drive to a place like this, and so they were coming to Shanksville to grieve for New York.” —Donna Glessner, Flight 93 volunteer docent

Visitors left mementos, which eventually warranted the construction of a temporary shrine at the crash site. These personal-public artifacts were diligently cleared and cleaned by the historians at the Somerset County Historical Society and museum, which primarily focuses on the area’s agricultural past. Museum historians and volunteers sought not to immediately display these materials but instead stored them safely, allowing time to season their interpretation. But even history is now subject to compression of time and space. Because of what the public has learned about the actions of passengers aboard Flight 93, the crash site, a small grove of hemlock trees in the middle of a cleared forest, was immediately considered by the National Park Service for preservation status akin to a Civil War battleground. At least for a century or more, this landscape will no longer retreat back into the forest but is instead captured in time so that it can exist as a stark and hallowed reminder. This barren landscape has already become embedded in the history of this community, its hills, and the nation.

Still, radiating out from this crash site, there are many local memorials that serve different populations and evoke other meanings. A memorial garden with a hero's path winds around the front of the Shanksville High School. This garden was funded by a group from Texas and has since drawn so many visitors that it has distracted teachers and students in the classroom, forcing them to close their window shades in the middle of the day. There is a new roadside Chapel specifically dedicated to September 11 that beckons those who need to sit, reflect, and renew. While some frequent the chapel, others drive past it with reactions ranging from slight

“And we ran into a number of people who had lost people in New York or Washington and for one reason or another couldn’t go there or didn’t want to go there, and so they came to our site, because they could, it was accessible, or closer, or they didn’t drive in urban areas but they could drive to a place like this, and so they were coming to Shanksville to grieve for New York.” — Donna Glessner, Flight 93 volunteer docent
curiosity to outright disdain. The Lummi Nation of Washington carved and transported a large totem pole from the west coast to Shanksville, permanently erecting it in a public park. It is part of the Lummi Nation’s effort to commune with spirit by connecting with the land surrounding each of the three crash locations.

The Legacy Groves sites are strategically positioned in places of local social meaning. These sites of newly planted groves of trees represent what is considered sacred about this community. While the national Flight 93 memorial is for the country, the Legacy Groves project is for the local community. The groves serve as a subtle reminder of a Pennsylvania landscape populated by sugar maples, fueled by agriculture and resource extraction, and connected by a host of traditions including pancake breakfasts and fire house dinners. In this way, the Legacy Groves mark what one might consider to be an early example of social networks created across space and time: rural life.

While Somerset County residents have never indicated that the crash was a burden, they voiced a concern about losing control over what is sacred in their lives and how to successfully navigate the waters of a rapid change. The Somerset County memorials which emerged then, now, and will emerge in the future symbolize how a community re-establishes its identity through the physical orientation of physical space in the days and years following such a tragic and unexpected event.
There are multiple memorials existing simultaneously at different scales and serving different populations, including the nation, the defense community, the victims’ families, the District, various neighborhoods, and individual schools and towns. Many of these memorials retain a certain amount of formality in their design, as if stewards were aware of the public scrutiny on monuments and memorials in and around the nation’s capital.

The Pentagon is a major employer and the military is a strong cultural presence throughout Arlington and Fairfax counties. Officials at the Pentagon worked to rebuild and reinforce the building in record time. Remaining true to the original façade and surface details was considered critical, so much so that even flaws in the original design were replicated, according to Marilyn Jajko of the U.S. Department of Defense. However, there was one major change: an interfaith chapel was created inside the Pentagon on the side of the building where the plane crashed. Invisible from the outside and inaccessible to the public, this chapel was created to serve those most directly affected by the tragedy within a private space. Moving beyond the boundaries of a closed community, by necessity, the Department of Defense recognized the need for a public memorial. Bringing the public in contact with Pentagon grounds is almost antithetical to values of security and privacy, but it was warranted by the events of September 11.

Design competitions became a primary means for selecting memorial forms and creators at all three crash sites. These competitions seek to avoid the pitfalls of...
design by committee by including panelists and judges with some amount of expertise in creating monumental places. The competition for the Pentagon Memorial was administered primarily by the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, though the memorial development closely involves the Department of Defense. Its selection committee included three former secretaries of defense and Lynn Cheney. The competition was announced on June 11, 2002, and attracted more than 5,000 entrants from 60 countries. A design by Keith Kaseman and Julie Beckman of New York City was eventually selected. This memorial will be a formally designed living memorial, featuring reflecting pools and a bench for each individual who died—arranged according to the age of the victim—interspersed with colorful trees.

“A vivid canopy of color and light provides shade throughout the site, as trees are clustered in conjunction with the disbursement of memorial units. Several maple species, especially the paperbark maple (Acer griseum) serve this scheme well. The paperbark is one of the last maples to drop their leaves, retaining their beautiful fall foliage well into the winter months—this suspension of time will contribute to the sublime beauty of the park. Upon maturity, the cinnamon-colored bark begins to exfoliate, exhibiting exquisite texture and color and overall year-round interest. On an intimate level, the interplay between leaves, light, bark, gravel, grasses, water, and the senses will be greatly enhanced with these elegant trees.”

—Kaseman Beckman Amsterdam Studio, Pentagon Memorial Design Description

With an awareness of the ever-changing memorial at the World Trade Center, the Family Commission at the Pentagon placed a “design lock” on certain aspects of the memorial’s form to ensure that the design selected would be the design that was created. Their letter noted that design locks had previously been used at the Vietnam Veteran’s Memorial and the Oklahoma City National Memorial.

In seeming recognition of the fact that the tragedy took place in Arlington rather than Washington, the District’s memorial will be more understated than the formal space at the Pentagon. The District has chosen Kingman Island in the Anacostia River as the site of its living memorial. The small island was created in the 1920s when the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers dredged the Anacostia and left two filled areas—Kingman and Heritage Island. The creation of a formal park on the island fits with the District’s recent attention to developing the Anacostia waterfront both as a natural resource and as real estate. The memorial, originally designed by David Kamp and Jeff Lee to be a healing landscape, features a pathway and several “nodes” through varied and naturalistic terrain. The memorial will take additional years to develop as the community gives input on the park, and the memorial design shifts.

Since the memorial at Kingman Island will take some time to develop, a partnership of public agencies along
with the nonprofit Green Spaces for DC worked to create ward-based living memorials across the district. Some of these groves have already been completed, including the first grove at the Congressional Cemetery in the Capitol Hill neighborhood. Just 10 minutes down river from the central Kingman Island site, Congressional Cemetery officials saw the grove as an opportunity to revitalize the living landscape of the cemetery, to attract additional visitors, and as a fitting tribute to September 11. Congressional Cemetery is both a sacred resting space as well as vibrant public space used by neighborhood residents for dog walking, by area bird-watchers, and by Girl Scouts in pursuit of their history merit badges. The Lummi Nation selected this site as the installation site for one of their Healing Totems until the point when the Kingman Island site is completed.

“We felt like, as a cemetery, we were a logical place to continue the sense of memorial. I guess you would fit this [living memorial] into the larger memorials or cenotaphs (empty tombs)—and Congressional has a long history of that. And while the marker for this “empty tomb” is different in that it’s trees, rather than a monument, there’s a long tradition here of not just headstones but also memorials to other events.”

—Linda Harper, Association for the Preservation of Historic Congressional Cemetery

Finally, smaller scale memorials dot the region, located primarily at civic grounds, such as municipal buildings and schools. Single tree and symbolic tree plantings dominate across the expanding Virginia suburbs reminding us that these traditions are a time-honored, even habitual, response to tragic events.

**JOURNEY 9 SITES**

- **American Forests Living Memorial Project**
  - Arlington, VA

- **Fairfax Memorial Garden Cemetery Memorial**
  - Fairfax, VA

- **Memorial Grove at Veterans Amphitheatre**
  - Fairfax City, VA

- **Memorial Tree to LTC Dennis M. Johnson and all 9/11 Victims at Burke Lake Park**
  - Fairfax, VA

- **Pentagon Memorial**
  - Arlington, VA

- **Washington D.C. September 11 Memorial Grove at Kingman Island**
  - Washington, DC

- **Washington D.C. September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 5: Langdon Park**
  - Washington, DC

- **Washington D.C. September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 6: Historic Congressional Cemetery**
  - Washington, DC

- **Wilton Woods Memorial Garden**
  - Alexandria, VA

- **Bertie Backus School Memorial Tree**
  - Washington, DC

- **Gardens of the World at Patrick Henry School**
  - Arlington, VA

- **Leckie Elementary School Garden Memorial**
  - Washington, DC

- **Robert J. Hymel Memorial Tree at Hoffman Boston Elementary School**
  - Arlington, VA

- **9/11 Memorial Grove at Fairfax County Government Center**
  - Fairfax, VA
As Robert Pogue Harrison has eloquently detailed in his essay, *Forests: The Shadow of Civilization*, the forest remains a paradox. He notes that Western religion depicts forests as both places of profanity and sacredness. They are lawless but they are also “havens for those who take up the cause of justice.” They have been used to describe notions of wildness, danger, and abandonment, yet “evoke scenes of enchantment.” Forests are places where what is rational and irrational intertwine. They are places were ‘our subjective categories are confounded’ (Harrison 1992, ix-x). In this sense, the forest remains open to interpretation depending upon time, place, and people.

Memorial forests exist in a range of sizes and forms, from tiny urban fragments to highly designed, formal spaces, to large wilderness areas. In Sterling Forest’s memorial, in Tuxedo, NY, one can get lost in the beauty of dying hemlock trees and an understory replanted with white pines. September 11 families and other victims of global violence participate in this unique bereavement program where persons of all ages are invited to plant, hike, eat, sleep, swim, laugh, and cry. The Sterling Forest program uses the forest to convey the notion that environmental restoration—like human recovery—is a lifelong pursuit, which holds unexpected and healing rewards. Near the Great Swamp, within New Jersey’s northern forests, the Shrine of St. Joseph’s September 11 memorial emerges just at the forest clearing, subtly rising up to meet its visitors. Similarly, the Brian Joseph Murphy Land Trust connects larger tracts of forest land back to the city of Westfield, MA, for future generations to experience in memory of a September 11 victim who grew up in the town.
“This section here is known as 100 acres, this was our running and romping grounds as kids…You come down here as a kid, and lie on the dike, and the hawks fly over, and you see the deer come by and we’ve got tons of moose down here now. People are seeing them all over the place. Every holiday Brian would come home and we’d go up on the dike and we’d talk and it would be where we would go to reconnect with what we had done as kids and look at this and that… We wanted to preserve it the way it was. One of the guys we worked with is a Harvard trained landscape architect and site planner and a really awesome guy. And we were like, ‘David, what should we do?’ And he said, ‘nothing, don’t be stupid!’”

—Harold Murphy, brother of Brian Joseph Murphy

But not all forest memorials are adjacent to large wooded parcels. Rededicated as a September 11 memorial, the Endor Community Garden in the Bronx is within earshot of the Henry Hudson Parkway. Located in the remnant and scrappy woods, it’s difficult to tell if you’re in a city or in a garden. Located in a township park with large, cleared areas for recreation, the memorial to September 11 victim Richard A. Cudina begins with a highly designed, formal entryway. Behind the built memorial, the trail disappears into a previously unmanaged edge of the park. Visitors find themselves ‘lost’ in a forest reminiscent of those Richard’s widow, Georgia Cudina, experienced during her childhood in Germany.

Other memorials are no more than a grove of trees, yet they embody the forest in their social meaning. Even a single memorial tree can be planted with that same impulse to connect to a larger system. While single trees are often interpreted as symbolizing a particular person or event, they hold meaning beyond the moment, often enabling those who participated in the planting to acknowledge death and return to life.
We chose to characterize certain September 11 memorials as ‘forests’ as these sites are places where individuals go to fulfill a desire to ‘lose oneself’ or ‘detach oneself’ from the public sphere. Several forest memorials were completely anonymous. Interviews with the creators of these spaces revealed a deliberate intent to connect with a larger, more resilient system from which they might come to terms with tragedy, and satisfy a desire to heal. In this way, forest stewards do not wish to particularize this experience through design but rather, attempt to minimize inscriptions leaving the memorial open to personal needs. There are forest memorials that include large granite stones—at first reminiscent of shrines and found space we had observed in New York City due to their use of grave-like headstones, candles, and the presence of personal mementos. However upon closer observation these stones also signify the forest. And again, Harrison’s essay reminds us that since the days of antiquity, both wooden and stone pillars were used to harbor the souls of sacred trees. In this sense, there may be times when city becomes forest. At that time both are anonymous, belonging to everyone—and compelling us to be at one with a larger ecology.

It is the resilient process within both forest and city that many have tried to initially capture in the design and designation of their memorials. Yet forests, like cities, are neither closed nor stable systems of regeneration. There is disturbance in any forest. And there is death. Perhaps these memorials are distinct because in some intangible way they help us understand how to confront what, at times, we cannot choose to deny.

JOURNEY 10 SITES

September 11th memorial forest, Quantico, MD
Sterling Forest, Tuxedo, NY
Endor Community Garden, Riverdale, NY
Long Island Pine Barrens
September 11th Community Forestry Restoration Project, Port Jefferson, NY
Garden of Healing in the Staten Island Botanical Garden, Staten Island, NY
Memorial of Remembrance at the Shrine of St. Joseph, Stirling, NJ
Richard Cudina Memorial, Glen Gardner, NJ
WTC Memorial Garden, Middletown, NJ

Brian Joseph Murphy Memorial Preservation Land Trust, Westfield, MA
Joel Barlow High School Monument, Easton, CT
In addition to their role as centers of knowledge and academic learning, schools are institutions of socialization that play a role in the formation of identity. Schools are a type of community with which individuals often have close ties. They are communities that, after September 11, reached out to claim “their own”, making connections to September 11 family members whether they sought out these connections or not. There is a likely variation between memorials that were created by schools at the request of family members and those that were created by schools, independent of family member interest; though this difference remains to be fully researched and understood.

It is clear that although schools have curricula and standards, they are in no way uniform. They vary geographically and promote messages that are embedded in a place, a culture, and a set of beliefs. As such, the memorials we observed are products of a variety of motivations: to teach, to create, to display patriotism, to encourage community service, and to honor other, local tragedies in addition to September 11.

Some school memorials were created to learn from September 11 as a “teachable moment” and to create a mechanism for healing. Students discussed concepts of life and loss and used nature in their memorials to connect to these cycles in a tangible, physical way. These memorials often focused on spreading peace...
and going through the process of creation—whether it be through poetry, art, design, or physical planting. The Whispering Pines Elementary School “Friendship and Tolerance Garden” in Boca Raton, FL, literally embodies these values through students’ plantings, handprints, artwork, and ongoing stewardship of the land. Nearly 400 students assisted in the design and development of the Leckie Elementary School memorial in Washington, D.C., which honors one teacher, one student, and two parents who were lost on September 11. Balloon launches and dove releases were also commonly used to help literally spread messages of peace and hope beyond the physical site of the schools.

“The memorial will thus provide the children with vehicles to express their feelings and emotions about the tragedy of September 11, 2001, as well as creating a special place that will tell the story of September 11...”

—East Islip, NY 9-11 Memorial Project Description

“Recognizing the need for the children in the community to express their emotions about the terrorist attack, East Islip Schools Superintendent [Michael] Capozzi requested that the project be student driven, from design to completion. The memorial will thus provide the children with vehicles to express their feelings and emotions about the tragedy of September 11, 2001, as well as creating a special place that will tell the story of September 11 and the world’s reaction to the tragedy, as told through the hearts and souls of East Islip students...This will be a place where these students can return, years from now with their children, to share with them what happened on September 11, 2001, and how it affected the world. Elements of the memorial will be reflective of the students’ expressions of emotion. An environment will be created that will honor heroes, mourn for the lives that were lost, and offer hope and healing for the future. The memorial also offers students a unique opportunity to apply what they have learned in the classroom to a real life project...and to help foster a stronger understanding of the meaning of community.”

—East Islip, NY 9-11 Memorial Project Description

Other memorials had an explicit focus on patriotism, with events occurring on national holidays and featuring red, white, and blue plantings. Symbolic trees were planted to represent the Twin Towers or to represent
Schools also used memorials as mechanisms for promoting service-learning, in the spirit of a community “barn raising.” Newspaper articles about these memorials featured the amount of funds and the mechanisms students used to raise them—from collecting pennies, to selling baked goods, to holding events. Often, physical memorials were dedicated in conjunction with a donation to a fund that benefited either victims’ families or various nonprofits. Another means of dedication was the creation of honorary scholarships. These memorials are motivated by the simple need to “do something” to connect with the tragedy that occurred.

The “11 Laps of Love” fundraiser, which involved members of the school community seeking sponsorship as they walked around the school track at Orange Park High School in Jacksonville, FL, raised $1,200 for the creation of a school memorial garden. Students at Eastside Elementary School in Hernando County, FL, sold American flag key chains to raise money for their memorial garden and for the American Red Cross.

We observed a blending of events as schools particularized the September 11 tragedy in the context of their own losses. Often, if a student or teacher passed away in that same year, schools chose to create joint memorials for their own and for those lost on September 11. Recognizing and responding to loss in this public way seemed to be a vehicle for healing, as it was for students, teachers, and staff at Acacia Middle School in Hemet, CA, which lost a number of members of its community to cancer right around the time of September 11.

The question remains: Why do schools become the most prevalent civic grounds for these various memorials to September 11? This was not necessarily the case with World War II or the Vietnam War, which certainly touched the lives of many thousands of young people as well. Perhaps it is due to the fact that, particularly on the east coast, the entirety of the brief but tragic events of September 11 was experienced during school hours.
For many students and the parents who went back to retrieve them, the tragedy will forever be remembered in the context of the school day. As with the assassination of John F. Kennedy, teachers and schools had to give improvised explanations for the inexplicable. Some used the moment as an opportunity to teach while some shielded children from information. America’s institutions are taking varied approaches to making sense out of an unprecedented event. As time goes on they will, unfortunately, have similar choices to make about future tragic events.

**JOURNEY 11 SITES**

9-11 Memorial Tree Grove at Chapin High School  
El Paso, TX

Cossatot Community College of the University of Arkansas  
De Queen, AR

Knoxville Freedom Trees Memorial  
Knoxville, IA

Memorial Courtyard at SUNY Binghamton  
Binghamton, NY

Open Road  
New York, NY

Penn State Mont Alto September 11 Memorial Planting  
Mont Alto, PA

Pepperdine University Heroes Garden  
Malibu, CA

Princeton University Alumni Memorial Garden  
Princeton, NJ

PS4K Paradise Garden  
Brooklyn, NY

September 11, 2001 Memorial at Farmingdale State University of New York  
Farmingdale, NY

Whispering Pines Friendship & Tolerance Garden  
Boca Raton, FL

Bertie Backus School Memorial Tree  
Washington, DC

Gardens of the World at Patrick Henry School  
Arlington, VA

Leckie Elementary School Garden Memorial  
Washington, DC

Saint Anthony’s High School Memorial  
South Huntington, NY

Alumni Memorial Fields at Riverdale Country School  
Riverdale, NY

Garrison Elementary School American Patriot Garden  
Garrison, NY

9-11 Seaford High School Memorial  
Seaford, NY

Acton Conant School Memorial Tree to Madeline Amy Sweeney  
Acton, MA

Christine’s Tree at the Old Academy Nursery School  
Easton, CT

Foxborough Regional Charter School  
Foxborough, MA

Susan L. Blair Memorial at Needham High School  
Needham, MA

The Memorial Labyrinth at Boston College  
Chestnut Hill, MA

University of Massachusetts at Lowell September 11, 2001 Memorial  
Lowell, MA

Legacy Groves of Somerset County, Somerset Vocational Technical Center Site  
Somerset, PA

Shanksville High School Memorial Garden  
Shanksville, PA

Rutgers Newark Campus tree  
Newark, NJ

September 11 Memorial at Bergen Catholic High School  
Oradell, NJ

Robert J. Hymel Memorial Tree at Hoffman Boston Elementary School  
Arlington, VA
New Civic Grounds

MEMORIALS OFTEN ARE FOUND WHERE WE MOST EXPECT TO FIND THEM. THEY ARE LOCATED ON TRADITIONAL CIVIC GROUNDS AT TOWN CENTERS, SUCH AS TOWN GREENS, CITY HALLS, PUBLIC LIBRARIES, AND NEAR OTHER MUNICIPAL BUILDINGS.

At these sites, September 11 memorials are located alongside memorials to wars, other tragedies, and famous local citizens. The memorials are created and maintained by municipal agencies and politicians along with concerned citizens out of a sense of the need to formally remember the day. Although they are often highly visible in the center of a town, they are not necessarily sites that are interwoven into the daily activities of people’s lives. They are symbolic sites that are visited during times of ritual and remembrance, such as the anniversary of September 11 and national holidays such as Independence Day and Memorial Day. Nearly 50 percent of the Living Memorials tracked in this study are located on some form of civic grounds.

But civic memorials also are found in less expected places, at emerging sites of social significance. Although the towns remain—as do their conventional civic grounds—new nodes and centers are developing as the social centers of towns are reconfigured. The changing location of our memorials reflects the changing form of American cities, including the sprawling edge city without a single, civic center.

“In towns such as ours, we’re 32 square miles, there is no town center. We don’t have a village square or center where people can meet as they do in Europe, but we are creating this as a center. This is the heart….it’s because of people like [Patricia Schriver] who are determined to find the center and find a way of bringing people together.”
—Eileen Swan, former Mayor of Lebanon Township

These memorials are found nationwide at both traditional town centers as well as at new civic grounds where people work, shop, pray, and drive, reflecting the changing form of the American city.
People find community not just through local government centers but through where they work, where they shop, where they pray, and even where they drive. Of the memorials on civic grounds, 50 percent are located on school grounds, 14 percent are at “traditional” town centers, 8 percent are at businesses, and 5 percent are at religious institutions.

In addition to the sites with symbolic links to September 11, such as fire stations, police departments, airports, embassies, and religious institutions, we found memorials in shopping malls, hospitals, train stations, museums, social service centers (for youth, homeless, etc.), retirement villages, and gated communities. Beside an International House of Pancakes restaurant in Wichita, KS, there is a living memorial of three lilac bushes dedicated to the 2000 attack on the USS Cole, the 1995 bombing of the Oklahoma City federal building, and the September 11 attack on the World Trade Center.

One example of a new town center is the corporate office park. Raytheon, Sun Microsystems, Hewlett-Packard, GM, and UNUM Provident all held tree plantings or created memorials at their corporate campuses in honor of the day. Whereas town centers were once civic, retail, and business cores, it is an established phenomenon over the last several decades that many American corporate headquarters are alongside highways rather than in downtowns. While some urban planners might bemoan the loss of the city center, it is noteworthy that corporate campuses have become nodes and centers of community in their own right. These corporate parks feature exercise facilities, child care, cafeterias, and some are equipped for 24-hour-a-day activity.

The TJX Corporation in Framingham, MA, lost seven female employees who were buyers bound for California on September 11. TJX spent more than a year working with family members and the firm Sasaki Associates in...
developing and designing a memorial sensory garden that is permanently located at one of the entrances to their office building and also is open to the public. The garden has become a part of the employee orientation and tour, and features etched glass panels with names and personal sentiments as well as favorite flowers of the women who were lost. It is a site for sitting and eating lunch or for quiet contemplation.

Is this expanded interpretation of civic grounds simply a function of the changing form of American cities from compact town to edge city? Could this reflect that the influence of traditional town centers is waning as new nodes and civic grounds continue to emerge? Much like the aging civic grounds themselves, how long will these memorials last?

JOURNEY 12 SITES

A Celebration of Life - Ramapo’s Walk of Rememberance
Ramapo, NY

Alabama Veterans Memorial Foundation and Park
Birmingham, AL

Arbor Day Trees as Tribute
Bloomingdale, IL

Freedom Blooms in Troy
Troy, AL

Freedom Trees Veterans Memorial Stadium
Cedar Rapids, IA

Freehold Township 9/11 Living Memorial Tree Grove
Freehold Township, NJ

Oak Ridge Cemetery Quercetum
Petersburg, IL

Sharon’s Arboretum September 11th Memorial Hemlock Grove
Durham, NH

We Remember September 11, 2001
Santurce, PR

9/11 Memorial Grove at Fairfax County Government Center
Fairfax, VA

Mahopac American Patriot Garden
Mahopac, NY

Orangetown American Patriot Garden
Orangeburg, NY

Scarsdale American Legion Memorial Garden
Scarsdale, NY

September 11 Memorial at Jacobi Medical Center
Bronx, NY

Town of Clarkstown American Patriot Garden
New City, NY

Town of Highlands American Patriot Garden
Highlands, NY

September 11 Memorial at Malverne Train Station
Malverne, NY

Rutgers Newark Campus Tree
Newark, NJ

September 11 Memorial at Bergen Catholic High School
Oradell, NJ

An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum
Manalapan, NJ

Bergen County Police Chiefs Association September 11, 2001 Memorial in Paramus Mall
Paramus, NJ

Bergen County Regional Medical Center
Paramus, NJ

EPA Office September 11 Memorial
Edison, NJ

Franklin Lakes Municipal Complex Memorial
Franklin Lakes, NJ

Marlboro Township Living Memorial
Marlboro, NJ

Groton Community Hanson Family Memorial
Groton, MA

Lowell Firehouse Mural
Lowell, MA

Memorial Tree to Michael McGinty at Foxborough Bethany Church
Foxborough, MA

TJX Family Memorial Garden
Framingham, MA

Everett, H. 2002.

Fraser, N. 1992.


This is an index of all of the living memorial projects that are either in the National Registry or were interviewed or photographed by Erika Svendsen and Lindsay Campbell. It is not an exhaustive list of all memorials in the United States. The Living Memorials Project is still growing and anyone can visit www.livingmemorialsproject.net/registry.asp to register their site.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Name or Site Location, Journey Number National Registry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site Typologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forest</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 64th Street Community Garden | Brooklyn, NY |
| 9/11 Memorial Grove at Fairfax County Government Center | Fairfax, VA |
| 9/11 Mural on Richmond Terrace | Staten Island, NY |
| 9-11 Memorial Tree Grove at Chapin High School | El Paso, TX |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9/11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9-11 Memorial Tree Grove at Chapin High School | El Paso, TX |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |

| 9-11 Seaford High School Memorial | Seaford, NY |

<p>| Arbor Day Trees as Tribute | Bloomingdale, IL |
| American Forests Living Memorial Project | Arlington, VA |
| An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum | Manalapan, NJ |
| Angel’s Circle | Staten Island, NY |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Memorial</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Memorial</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Memorial</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Memorial</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Memorial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fairfax Memorial Garden Cemetery Memorial</td>
<td>Fairfax, VA</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>First Quincy Street Garden Memorial to NYC Black Firemen</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Garden of Reflection Yardley, PA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden of Healing in the Staten Island Botanical Garden</td>
<td>Staten Island, NY</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Freedom Blooms in Troy</td>
<td>Troy, AL</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Trees Veterans Memorial Stadium</td>
<td>Cedar Rapids, IA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Grove of Healing at Sunset Park</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gateway Greening 9-11 Orchard</td>
<td>St. Louis, MO</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Groton Community Hanson Family Memorial</td>
<td>Groton, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groton Painted Post Road Hanson Family Memorial</td>
<td>Groton, MA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grove of Healing in Staten Island Nature Park</td>
<td>Staten Island, NY</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Battle of the Wilderness Park</td>
<td>Brunswick, GA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coopers Pond September 11 Memorial</td>
<td>Bergenfield, NJ</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coscatot Community College of the University of Arkansas De Queen, AR</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crescent Beach Park—Flagpole/Memorial for 9/11 Victims</td>
<td>Staten Island, NY</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Islip 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>East Islip, NY</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Village Murals</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eisenhower Park American Patriot Garden</td>
<td>Hempstead, NY</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ender Community Garden</td>
<td>Riverdale, NY</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPA Office September 11 Memorial</td>
<td>Edison, NJ</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erhart Clam House Mural</td>
<td>Freeport, NY</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gardens of the World at Patrick Henry School</td>
<td>Arlington, VA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazlet Township 9-11 Tree and Garden Memorial</td>
<td>Hazlet, NJ</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healing Trees Project Yonkers, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highbridge Park Living Memorial</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoboken September 11 Memorial Tree Grove</td>
<td>Hoboken, NJ</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immaculate Conception Cemetery September 11, 2001 Memorial</td>
<td>Lawrence, MA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In God We Trust, United We Stand, September 11, 2001 Memorial Garden</td>
<td>Beaumont, TX</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian River Boulevard Memorial</td>
<td>Vero Beach, FL</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony Grove Peace Walk and Labyrinth</td>
<td>Bronx, NY</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Peace Garden 9/11 Memorial</td>
<td>Dunseith, ND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jes’ Good Rewards/Benjamin Keeffe Clark III Memorial</td>
<td>Brooklyn, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joel Barlow High School Monument</td>
<td>Easton, CT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jones Beach State Park</td>
<td>Hempstead, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keep Fremont</td>
<td>Fremont, NE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knoxville Freedom Trees Memorial</td>
<td>Knoxville, IA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leckie Elementary School Garden Memorial</td>
<td>Washington, DC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legacy Groves of Somerset County, Windber Coal</td>
<td>Windber, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legacy Groves of Somerset County, Windber Community Library Site</td>
<td>Windber, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legacy Groves of Somerset County, Windber Junior and Senior High School Site</td>
<td>Windber, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty Garden</td>
<td>Ocala, FL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Memorial Grove of Survivor Trees at Brooklyn Bridge</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Memorial Trail</td>
<td>Bronx, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marlboro Township Living Memorial</td>
<td>Marlboro, NJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McCourt Memorial Garden New London</td>
<td>New London, CT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Island Pine Barrens September 11th Community Forestry Restoration Project</td>
<td>Port Jefferson, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowell Firehouse Mural</td>
<td>Lowell, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Manhattan Engine 10 Firehouse</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Manhattan Streetscape</td>
<td>Manhattan, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahoning Valley 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>Youngstown, OH</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahopac American Patriot Garden</td>
<td>Mahopac, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Courtyard at SUNY Binghamton</td>
<td>Binghamton, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Grove at Veterans Amphitheatre</td>
<td>Fairfax, VA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial of Remembrance at the Shrine of St. Joseph</td>
<td>Stirling, NJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Peace Garden Saxonburg</td>
<td>Saxonburg, PA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Tree to LTC Dennis M. Johnson and all 9/11 Victims at Burke Lake Park</td>
<td>Fairfax, VA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Tree to Michael McGinty at Foxborough Bethany Church</td>
<td>Foxborough, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Treeway of Champion Trees in Calvary Cemetery</td>
<td>Queens, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael E. Brennan Memorial Tree Long Island City</td>
<td>Long Island City, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Million Flower Garden</td>
<td>Seattle, WA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mormon County 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>Atlantic Highlands, NJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montauk Lighthouse 9-11 Memorial</td>
<td>Montauk, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montauk Rock</td>
<td>Montauk, NY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nellie’s Point at Nobska Lighthouse</td>
<td>Woods Hole, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nellie's Point at Nobska</td>
<td>Woods Hole, MA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110111</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110112</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXHIBITION DESCRIPTION

Living memorials are spaces created, used, or reappropriated by people as they employ the landscape to memorialize individuals, places, and events. Ranging from single tree plantings, to the creation of new parks, to the rededication of existing forests, hundreds of groups across the country created a vast network of sites that continues to grow.

“Land-markings: 12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials” is a multimedia exhibition that compresses four years of research data and analysis on over 700 living memorials into 12 digitally authored journeys. Social science researchers, urban ecologists, designers, and architects collaborated in order to collect, analyze, and present the dispensed collective response to the tragedy of September 11, 2001. And while this interpretation presents memorials not only as mechanisms by which we mark events and individuals, but also interprets the function and spatial location of these remembrances, treating them as emergent forms that outline how we interact with our public landscapes.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This exhibition was organized jointly by Parsons The New School For Design, The Tishman Environment and Design Center at The New School, and the USDA Forest Service Northern Research Station. The Living Memorials Project is a collaborative effort of the USDA Forest Service’s Northern Research Station and Northeastern Area, State & Private Forestry. The Living Memorials Project Web site was created by Steven Romalewski, Christy Spielman, Marty DelBene/s/ at the Open Accessible Space Information System (www.oasisnyc.net) and is currently maintained by the Center for Urban Research at The Graduate Center/CUNY. Joel Towers, Associate Provost for Environmental Studies and Director of the Tishman Environment and Design Center was instrumental in securing support for this exhibition. We would also like to thank Michael Rains, Mark Twery, J. Morgan Divine, Rob Morgan, Philip Reddul, and Matthew Ammi of the Forest Service and Colleen Murphy-Dunning and Chris Marchand at Yale University’s Urban Resources Initiative for their continued support and interest in urban environmental stewardship, including this unique research project. The exhibit was held at the National Park Service Federal Hall National Memorial in New York City, and particular thanks go to Michael Callahan and Jim Pepper for their assistance in making it possible. Finally, we thank all the creators, stewards, and users of living memorials who spent time sharing their sites and their stories.

Published by:
USDA FOREST SERVICE
11 CAMPUS BLVD SUITE 200
NEWTOWN SQUARE
PA  19073-3294

For additional copies:
USDA Forest Service
Publications Distribution
280 Main St.
Duluth, MN 55801-0415
Phone: (720) 564-0130
Fax: (720) 564-0132

September 2006
http://www.nrs.fs.fed.us

Curation and research: Erika Svendsen and Lindsay Campbell, USDA Forest Service, Northern Research Station
Curation and design: Brian McGrath, Parsons The New School for Design
Media design: Phu Duong, Approach
Installation: Ethan Lu, Metropolitan United Studio, LLC
Catalog editing: Susan Wright, USDA Forest Service, Northern Research Station
Production assistance: Flore Kohnan, USDA Forest Service

http://www.livingmemorialsproject.net/
Living Memorials Project
http://www.livingmemorialsproject.net/

The cover of this catalog is an image taken from the interactive Living Memorials Project National Map. It shows the location and site type of approximately 700 living memorials created, used, or rededicated in honor of September 11, 2001. These sites were documented by USDA Forest Service researchers from 2002-2006, and cataloged in an archive of thousands of images that will soon be made available to the public.

Land-markings:
12 Journeys through 9/11 Living Memorials

ERIKA S. SVENDSEN AND LINDSAY K. CAMPBELL
USDA Forest Service, Northern Research Station